VOICES OF ENGAGEMENT

In Support of Trade With China
VOICES OF ENGAGEMENT:

Gerald R. Ford
Jimmy Carter
George Bush

Part of a Continuing Series from the Business Coalition for U.S.-China Trade

“There is no doubt that China's World Trade Organization (WTO) membership and PNTR will serve our national interest.

In economic terms, the case is clear... [The agreement] builds upon a series of market opening initiatives pursued by Presidents since the Second World War. It will open China's markets to us without increasing China's access to our market. But Americans can only reap the benefits of this if Congress approves PNTR. A failure to do so would cost America jobs.

The national security interest is also compelling. Enactment of PNTR will reduce the volatility and improve the atmosphere of U.S.-China relations, strengthen our ability to move China in the right direction, and increase China's stake in stability and prosperity in the region and beyond...

For all these reasons, the agreement to bring China into the WTO represents a turning point in our relationship with that profoundly important country and in its future development. We urge the Congress to embrace this agreement and to bring its benefits home by voting for PNTR.”

-- Letter to Americans, May 8, 2000

THEY LED OUR NATION.
THEY SUPPORT PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
“History has demonstrated that implicit in any removal of power from central planners and broadening of market mechanisms... is a more general spread of rights to individuals. Such a development will be a far stronger vehicle to foster other individual rights than any other alternative of which I am aware.

Further development of China’s trading relationships with the United States and other industrial countries will work to strengthen the rule of law within China and to firm its commitment to economic reform.”

-- Letter to House Banking Chairman Jim Leach, May 5, 2000

GUIDING HAND OF AMERICAN PROSPERITY.  
SUPPORTER OF PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
“The more we can do to pull China into the new, changing world economic system the better off we’ll be... We can grant them permanent normal trading relations, and in the same voice, criticize their human rights position, let them know that we are very disturbed when they issue threats toward Taiwan... [But] suppose we stiff them. Is that going to make China more likely to be a contributing and positive member of the world organizations? Or is it going to make them more isolated, truculent and more aggressive?... So I think from every standpoint—from the strategic standpoint, from the standpoint of our national interests, from the standpoint of our trading interests and our economic interests— it serves all of our purposes to grant permanent normal trading relations to China.”

Gen. Colin L. Powell, USA (ret.)
Former Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff
Former National Security Advisor

Source: Reuters interview, April 12, 2000

**CHAMPION OF AMERICAN SECURITY.**
**SUPPORTER OF PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.**
George W. Bush: “I support permanent normal trade relations for China as part of China's admission to the WTO... It will provide American businesses and farmers access to China's growing market and narrow our trade deficit with China... To join the WTO, China is agreeing to live by fair trading rules... As we export American goods and services into China, we will export American values, especially freedom.”

Al Gore: “I support extension of most favored nation status for China through accession to the World Trade Organization... failure to grant China permanent normal trade relations will put American farmers and factories at a vast disadvantage with respect to Europe and Japan and hurt our ability to enforce China's commitments in the WTO.”

Source: The Associated Press, January 5, 2000
“We have worked hard over the last three decades to fashion a constructive relationship with China that serves our broad foreign policy interests... Permanent Normal Trade Relations will strengthen our nation's security and prosperity. It is in our long-term interest - and that of others in the international community - to develop a relationship with China that is stable and predictable. [PNTR] will help us meet the challenge of history by helping China choose the right future.”

Henry A. Kissinger
Alexander M. Haig, Jr.
George P. Shultz
James A. Baker, III
Lawrence S. Eagleburger
Warren Christopher

ARCHITECTS OF AMERICAN FOREIGN POLICY FOR 30 YEARS.
THEY SUPPORT PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
“China's full integration into the global trading system will mark an important milestone in the post-war development of the world economy. It is vital for American leadership that we fully support these historic developments. A more open, market-oriented, prosperous China, firmly rooted in the international economic system, is profoundly in the interests of the United States... Passage of Permanent Normal Trade Relations will ensure that Americans will be able to fully share in the benefits.”

James A. Baker III  G. William Miller
Lloyd M. Bentsen  Robert E. Rubin
W. Michael Blumenthal  George Shultz
Nicholas F. Brady  William Simon
C. Douglas Dillon

HELMSMEN OF THE U.S. ECONOMY SINCE THE KENNEDY ADMINISTRATION. THEY SUPPORT PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
“While the rest of the nation has enjoyed unprecedented prosperity, agriculture is facing its third consecutive year of low prices and economic sluggishness. Agriculture is highly dependent on exports, more than twice as much as other sectors of the economy... By rejecting PNTR, we would be walking away from an increase of approximately $2 billion in annual farm sales. It would amount to a kind of unilateral economic disarmament... it would also be an irresponsible abdication of American global leadership.”

Orville Freeman, 1961-69  John Block, 1981-86
Bob Bergland, 1977-81  Mike Espy, 1993-94

THEY HAVE BEEN STANDING UP FOR AMERICAN FARMERS SINCE 1961. THEY SUPPORT PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
"Under the terms of its agreement to join the World Trade Organization (WTO), China will undertake the most dramatic market opening initiatives in its history. Overall tariffs will drop from 24 percent to 9 percent. American companies in industries ranging from technology to financial services to agriculture will benefit from unprecedented access to the world’s largest market.

Voting against permanent normal trade relations for China will not derail China’s admission to the WTO. It will, however, mean that only our competitors in Europe, Latin America, and Asia will reap the benefits from access to China’s 1.2 billion consumers."

Dr. Juanita M. Kreps
Michael Kantor
C. William Verity
Alexander B. Trowbridge
Robert Mosbacher
Peter G. Peterson
Barbara Hackman Franklin
Frederick B. Dent

--- Letter to Congress, May 8, 2000

They fought on the front lines of trade.
They support permanent normal trade relations with China.
Chen Shui-Bian
President-elect of Taiwan

From the Los Angeles Times, Wednesday, March 22, 2000

Chen Says He Hopes China Gains Entry to WTO

Says he wants the island and mainland to both gain entry into the WTO and improve cross-strait ties.

“In a gesture to Beijing and the Clinton administration, Taiwanese president-elect Chen Shui-bian said today he hopes to see China enter the World Trade Organization and to have normal trade relations with the United States.

‘We would welcome the normalization of U.S.-China trade relations, just like we hope the cross-strait relations [between Taiwan and China] can also be normalized,’ Chen said. ‘We look forward to both the People’s Republic of China’s and Taiwan’s accession to the WTO.’

Chen made these remarks during an hour-long exclusive interview with The Times, the first he has granted since his election Saturday as Taiwan’s next president... Despite the friction between Taipei and Beijing on other issues, Taiwan has a strong but little-recognized economic interest in making sure that China has normal trade relations with the United States. Many Taiwanese companies manufacture on the Chinese mainland and export their products from China to the U.S. market.”

There aren’t many who have more at stake. He supports permanent normal trade relations with China.
“The participation of China in the WTO would not only have economic and political benefits, but would also serve to bolster those in China who understand that the country must embrace the rule of law.”

-- Martin Lee, Chairman, Democratic Party of Hong Kong

Source: Letter to President Clinton, November 14, 1999

- **Rule of Law.** In 1998, the National People’s Congress expanded citizens’ rights by restricting arbitrary detention without trial and guaranteeing access to counsel in criminal cases. Nearly 30,000 lawsuits are filed annually challenging abuses of state power, of which about 20% lead to outcomes striking down or modifying the government’s decision.

- **Village-level Democracy.** About 500 million Chinese peasants have participated in village-level elections. In some provinces, 40% of winning candidates do not belong to the Communist Party.

- **Access to Information.** Millions of ordinary Chinese now have access to Hong Kong television programs, foreign magazines and newspapers, the Internet, satellite dishes, and copier and fax machines.

**CHAMPION OF FREEDOM IN HONG KONG.**

**SUPPORTER OF PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.**
“I have heard on the news that two of the groups I admire most in the U.S.—the AFL-CIO and the Sierra Club—are against granting permanent normal trade relations with China... As a Chinese environmentalist and human rights activist, I disagree with their position, although I am fully sympathetic with their causes... The disagreement between me, together with many of my fellow human rights activists and environmentalists in China, and our counterparts in the U.S. is not over the principles of environmental protection and labor rights. Rather, the disagreement is with the means of improving human rights... I believe that permanent normal trade status, with its implication of openness and fairness, is among the most powerful means of promoting freedom in China. Starting in 1978, the open-door policy completely changed the way China responded to the world. Today, PNTR is a powerful means to keep China’s doors as open as possible.”

---Dai Qing, writing in the Los Angeles Times, April 20, 2000

Dai Qing is a Chinese investigative journalist and environmentalist. She is winner of the 1993 Goldman Environment Award and the 1992 Golden Pen for Freedom given by the International Federation of Newspaper Publishers. She was imprisoned in China for 10 months from 1989 to 1990. Her book criticizing the Three Gorges Dam project remains banned in China.

**SHE SEEKS A CHINA THAT IS MORE FREE AND MORE OPEN.**
**SHE SUPPORTS PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.**
Ren Wanding, Leader of the 1978 Democracy Wall Movement in China:

"Before the sky was black. Now there is a light... This can be a new beginning."

[Washington Post, 11/18/99]

Xu Youyu, Prominent Chinese Philosopher:

Xu said the decision to join the WTO marked “the first time in a long time that there seems to be a real direction” in China’s government. “People always say China can never go back, but over the last 20 years, and even during the last year, we’ve taken a lot of detours. Now we have a clear direction in the long run it will help.”

[Washington Post, 11/18/99]

Li Ke, Former Chinese Editor of the Democratic Journal Fangfa:

“For so many years of China’s reform and opening, these areas couldn’t be opened up and remained state monopolies. But if economic monopolies can be broken, controls in other areas can have breakthroughs as well. These breakthroughs won’t necessarily happen soon. But in the final analysis, in the minds of ordinary people, it will show that breakthroughs that were impossible in the past are indeed possible.”

[Washington Post, 11/18/99]

Wang Shan, Chinese Liberal Political Scientist:

“Undoubtedly, [the China WTO agreement] will push political reform.”

[The Boston Globe, 11/28/99]

They are among China’s harshest critics. They support permanent normal trade relations with China.
"Our case for greater trade... is less about money and more about morality. It is about ensuring that one-fifth of the world’s population is not shut off from businesses spreading the message of freedom - and ministries spreading the love of God... Is it any surprise that some of our nation's most respected religious leaders, from Billy Graham to Pat Robertson, have called for keeping the door to China open?" -- Hon. Randy Tate, Co-Chair Working Families for Free Trade, former Executive Director of Christian Coalition (1999).

"[A] public Christian stance against MFN status for China is not in the interest of the church in China, and will seriously hamper the efforts of Christians from outside China who have spent years seeking to establish an effective Christian witness among the Chinese people. For this reason the China Service Coordinating Committee, which services more than one hundred Christian organizations involved in service and Gospel witness in China, cannot support the current anti-MFN campaign and calls upon those involved in the campaign to seriously consider their strategy and methods." -- China Service Coordinating Committee, Billy Graham Center, Wheaton College (1997).

"Trade sanctions won't bring freedom for religious expression in China. They won't end China's cruel policies limiting family size. They won't stop the horrific policy of forced abortions. They won't bring democracy... Just as religious freedom offers the best hope for Christian social influence, economic freedom is the best hope for spreading that influence around the world." -- The Rev. Robert A. Sirico, a Paulist priest and president of The Acton Institute for The Study of Religion and Liberty.

VOICES OF CONSCIENCE.
SUPPORTERS OF PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
"As governors who are working hard to improve living standards for all Americans, we urge your support of PNTR status for China. China is by far the world's largest and most important emerging market. The commitments China made during the WTO negotiations with the United States promise to open new markets and create tremendous opportunities for American workers.

Unlike most other trade agreements that require both sides must make concessions, China must unilaterally open its market as the price of its admission to the WTO...

We believe that China's entry into the WTO would be extremely positive for the United States. The opening of China's markets will create numerous opportunities for our nation. Yet, if we do not hold up our end of the bargain by approving PNTR for China, other countries will reap the benefits of the agreement, leaving the United States sitting on the sidelines. We strongly urge you to vote in favor of PNTR status for China."

-- Letter to Congress Signed by 47 U.S. Governors, March 31, 2000
“As state and local officials, we understand that today’s strong and stable economy depends on expanding markets around the world for the goods and services our communities produce. Expanded trade has been a critical component of the unprecedented economic prosperity of the past six years.

New opportunities for trade expansion are on the horizon...

We call on Congress to do its part and approve Permanent Normal Trade Relations with China—nothing more or less than we have granted China on an annual basis for 19 years—and the same status we provide to all other 134 WTO members, and to all but a handful of other countries.”

-- Letter to Congress Signed by more than 140 mayors, state legislators, and other local elected officials, May 9, 2000
“They [unions] better modernize themselves and realize that opening up China to our trade is going to create more jobs here, because we’re in a position where we’re giving up nothing. Whatever China is sending here now they’ll continue to send here. But what is happening [with this agreement] is tariffs are going to go down, markets in China are going to go open up.”

-- Gov. Jesse Ventura of Minnesota, March 27, 2000

Source: Associated Press, March 27, 2000

HE’S KNOWN FOR HIS GOOD OLD-FASHIONED AMERICAN COMMON SENSE. HE SUPPORTS PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
“I have spent much of my life in the labor movement and remain deeply loyal to its goals. But in this instance, I think our labor leaders have got it wrong... American labor has a tremendous interest in China’s trading on fair terms with the U.S. The agreement we signed with China this past November marks the largest single step ever taken toward achieving that goal.”

-- Leonard Woodcock, former president of the United Auto Workers and former U.S. ambassador to China


Also from the Washington Post story:

- “Woodcock has earned his stripes in the American labor movement. A key lieutenant in the 1930s drive to unionize the U.S. auto industry, he later rose to president of the UAW and led a major strike against General Motors.”

- “He said... limiting Chinese access to the U.S. market would not help reduce the U.S. trade deficit. Instead, he said, it would only add to imports of cheap goods from other low-wage, developing nations. Finally, Woodcock argues that increased access for foreign firms to the Chinese market eventually will improve conditions for Chinese workers.”

HE HAS Fought FOR LABOR SINCE THE 1930S.
HE SUPPORTS PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.
VOICES OF ENGAGEMENT:

Experts On Chinese Labor

Part of a Continuing Series from the Business Coalition for U.S.-China Trade

“China’s workers need higher labor standards, but opposing PNTR is not going to help... Opposing PNTR and WTO membership for China would undermine the very forces that are contributing to rising standards for Chinese labor... ”
--Joint letter of America’s leading experts on China’s economy and society, March 30, 2000*

Loren Brandt
Professor of Economics
University of Toronto

Thomas R. Gottschang
Associate Professor and Chair
Department of Economics, College of the Holy Cross

Doug Guthrie
Associate Professor of Sociology
New York University

Gary H. Jefferson
Carl Marks Professor of International Trade and Finance
Graduate School of International Economics and Finance
Brandeis University

Lawrence J. Lau
Kwoh-Ting Li Professor of Economic Development
Department of Economics
Stanford University

Barry Naughton
Professor
Graduate School of International Relations & Pacific Studies,
University of California, San Diego

Dwight Perkins
H.H. Burbank Professor of Political Economy
Harvard University

Thomas G. Rawski
Professor of Economics and History
University of Pittsburgh

Bruce L. Reynolds
Professor of Economics
Union College

Scott Rozelle
Associate Professor
Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics
University of California, Davis

Ezra F. Vogel
Henry Ford II Professor of Social Sciences
Harvard University

Martin King Whyte
Professor of Sociology and International Affairs
The George Washington University

*For the text of the letter and a list of publications on Chinese labor issues by these experts, go to www.uschina.org

THEY STUDY CHINA’S LABOR MARKETS FOR A LIVING.
THEY SUPPORT PERMANENT NORMAL TRADE RELATIONS WITH CHINA.